



MIRA - WP 2 – Observatory of EU-MPC cooperation in S&T
« Scientific cooperation indicators and impact measures »

Meeting Minutes

The Workshop on Indicators of Scientific Cooperation was held on the 16th and 17th of March, 2009 at the IRD – Institut de Recherche pour la Développement – in Bondy, France.

This workshop was organized by IRD (Rigas Arvanitis) in the framework of the MIRA Project « *Mediterranean Innovation and Research coordination Action* » and more particularly under work package 2 on the « *Observatory of EU-MPC cooperation in S&T* » under the leadership of IRD and co-leadership of the CNRS - National Council for Scientific Research – Lebanon.

Recalling that, INCONET projects constitute the principal instrument of international S&T cooperation undertaken by the EU with third countries, and as a follow-up to bi-regional cooperation between the EU and the concerned region.

Participants (See Annex I for a List of Participants)

The list of 36 participants includes:

- A number of representatives from the CNRS, Lebanon: The Secretary General, Mouïh Hamzé; Hassan Charif; and Rula Atweh.
- Hatem, M’Henni (ONST Tunisia): a principal author of the indicators of the workshop; holding regular discussions and working closely with Rigas Arvanitis on the principal list of indicators for MIRA
- MIRA Representatives: Coordinator, Rafael Rodriguez Clemente (CSIC, Spain) and Zayer El Majid (Director of Technology at the Ministry of Research in Morocco). The Moroccan Ministry was also represented by M. Ezzarfi.
- Members of the MIRA Project: Giovanni B Buttigieg (Malta), Bülent Karasözen (Turkey), in addition to the Moroccan Ministry, IRD, ONST and CNRS.
- From the Authorities: two scientific officers of the EU Commission (Philippe Froissard and Peter Mayr), Jean-Luc Clément of the DREIC and Fatima Ouali of the MAEE
- A number of French and International Partners of IRD: Patrick Séchet (representing OST and EULARINET), Daniel Villavicencio (UAM, Mexico), and Najib Hatimi (Academy of Science, Morocco). Unfortunately the two participants from the

Moroccan IMIST who have begun bibliometric work were unable to attend the proceedings in Paris.

- IFRIS, co-organizers of the workshop: represented by the active participation of Rémi Barré and two members of the central administration, Antoine Schoen (Responsible for the indicators project of IFRIS) and Marianne Noel (Deputy Director). They announced holding the next ENID – European Network of Indicators Designers – conference on the theme of « *STI Indicators for Policymaking and Strategic Decision* »¹ in March, 2010 in Paris.
- Participant from the INCONET Project EULARINET (Isabel Gómez and Patrick Séchet). Miriam Cué and Nathanaëlle Soler –both in charge of INCONETs in IRD– were unable to attend due to a EULARINET reunion in Cartagena
- Strong participation from IRD: coordinators of the CORUS project (Philippe Hamelin and Sébastien Hubert); L'UR 105 « Knowledge and Development » Team (bibliometric work of P Luigi Rossi and Roland Waast; Evaluation of IFS by Jacques Gaillard), Documentation (Dominique Cavet), Representative in Brussels (Patrice Cayré)

Workshop Proceedings (see Annex II – Programme of the Workshop and List of presentations)

The workshop proceedings were opened by George de Noni (IRD) and Philippe Froissard (INCO- EU). [Rafael Rodriguez presented the framework of the MIRA project](#) and positioned the work package **within the Euro-Mediterranean research policy**.

The meeting was divided into three parts:

- 1) Evaluation of programmes in regards to research and technology,
- 2) The presentation of experiences – particularly related to indicators - from MIRA and within the framework of European projects,
- 3) Development of a specific list of indicators for the follow-up of bi-regional EU-MPC co-operation; which was the announced purpose and deliverable of the workshop.

As part of the evaluation of programmes, [Rémi Barré](#) and [Daniel Villavincencio](#) presented the central questions in the development of indicators of cooperation: the need to modify, redefine and position indicators in the increased appearance of a multitude of actors; and difficulties and shortcomings posed by the indicators, and in particular the absence of the ability to measure inter-connections, relations, and dynamics of research.

The evaluation of the programmes

As shown in the presentation of [Philippe Larrue, Director of Technopolis-France](#), important experiences in the field do exist and Technopolis is well positioned as one of the organizations which holds, and if necessary can be beneficial, in its experience. The presentations of [Philippe Hamelin \(Evaluation of the CORUS programme of international cooperation with the countries of the south\)](#) and of [Jacques Gaillard, who described a similar experiment to the International Foundation of Science \(IFS\)](#), underlined the particular difficulties in measuring the results, effect and impacts of such an exercise. The presentation of Mr. [Abdelouahid Ezzarfi of the Moroccan Ministry of National Education treated the evaluation of universities](#) on the same model of the Research Assessment Exercise (RAE) in Britain. Finally, [Rigas Arvanitis presented the form that can be adopted and elaborated with the framework of programme evaluation](#) and the principal difficulties in that.

¹ <http://www.enid-europe.org/conference.html>.

Experiences in the field of indicators:

Within this second topic of the workshop, the following presentations were made: the [Lebanese Observatory of Research, Development and Innovation \(Rula Atweh\)](#), Inco-Net [EULARINET in Latin America \(Patrick Séchet\)](#) and [the indicators developed within the framework of this EULARINET project \(Isabel Gómez - IEDCyT\)](#). [Bülent Karasözen, of the Middle East Technical University in Ankara, presented the scientific and technical positioning of Turkey](#), with methods and indicators very close to those used by the OST. [Pier Luigi Rossi](#) and [Roland Waast](#) presented the development of the fine tools of bibliometry (shift-and-share, scoreboard at the level of institutions). [Dominique Cavet](#), the person in charge of documentation within IRD, described the use of the indicators of research by concerned parties of international co-operation, while [Patrice Cayré](#) presented the stakes of the co-operation with the African countries in the field of the S&T. Unfortunately the IMIST in Morocco was unable to attend to present its experience and current programmes in the field. [Hatem M'Henni from ONST-Tunisia, made a presentation that focuses on the innovation and S&T indicators experiences available in the Mediterranean Region](#) and worldwide.

Indicators of ST&I cooperation:

Elaborating the indicator of bi-regional ST&I cooperation within the framework of MIRA is of particular importance, particularly as the political dialogue between the two areas was established within the framework of the Barcelona Process and has been functioning particularly well for the past 10 years under the MoCo framework. This is a singular situation which one does not find in other INCO-NETs. Moreover, this “Monitoring Committee,” and the MIRA project constitute the operational instruments of ST&I and are expected to play an increasing role with the recent adoption and implementation of the Union for the Mediterranean. In addition, the work being done on the selection of key indicators of scientific cooperation is strongly supported by MoCo and thus by the European Commission (though it is still at a preliminary stage.)

The scientific leaders of this exercise, in addition to the IRD team, are: Hatem M’Henni (Director of the National Observatory of Science and Technology in Tunis), and the National Council for Scientific Research in Lebanon (Hassan Charif and Rula Atweh). During the workshop, a discussion of the preliminary list of indicators was held. The list was validated, but basic problems and shortcoming were also exposed.

Relations vis-à-vis the INCO-NET:

MIRA is positioned as a dialogues instigator between the different INCO-NETs. It postulates the promotion of exchanges between corresponding and similar European projects.

Some conclusions (see also R. Arvanitis final presentation) :

The assessment framework should:

- Take into account the contextual institutional elements – like the policies, the legal framework, etc.
- Include the functioning of units performing research
- Take into account the role of research inside universities, which appears as a central thematic for all, policy-makers, researchers, students, and donors

- Permit to include the concepts that would define the scientific community – a concept that is particularly necessary in the context of most Mediterranean countries where the scientific communities are still not auto-regulated
- Include the various aspects of the international relations, and cooperation
- Examine the economic impact of research

Our general roadmap for WP2 :

- White paper on indicators for MIRA
- Refine the indicators – see above
- Present a preliminary overview of the state-of-art of the discussion on indicators – M'henni
- Refine the methodological debate
- Examine the possibility for indicators for different actors – positioning indicators
- Clearly state the limits of the indicators
- Discuss the benchmarking issues – this is also urgent and a political need
- Discuss the relation of indicators-evaluation and policy
- Explain the link assessment framework-indicators

Other actions for the future:

- Consolidate the indicators units – Lebanon, Tunisia, Morocco, Jordan, Egypt
- Create a differentiated network of observatories: Turkey, Malta, France as first movers
- Identify all producers able to manage distinct sources:
 - Bibliometrics
 - Innovation surveys + technological dev and innovation
 - Participation of MPC in EU projects
- Promote the links between INCONETS
- Locate MIRA inside other networks like ENID, other observatories like OST etc,
- Continue the policy promotion for eg. in Union for Mediterranean.



LISTE OF PARTICIPANTS – MIRA WORKSHOP INDICATORS – 16 & 17 MARCH 2009

Prénom	Nom	Institution	Pays	Mail
Philippe	Froissard	INCO - DG Research - European Commission	Brussels	Philippe.Froissard@ec.europa.eu
Peter	Mayr	INCO - DG Research - European Commission	Brussels	Peter.Mayr@ec.europa.eu
Rula	Atweh	CNRSL	Lebanon	rula.atweh@cnrs.edu.lb
Hassan	Charif	CNRSL	Lebanon	hcharif@cnrs.edu.lb
Mouïñ	Hamzé	CNRSL . Secretary General	Lebanon	hamze@cnrs.edu.lb
Giovanni-Battista	Buttigieg	MCST	Malta	giovanni-battista.buttigieg@gov.mt
Daniel	Villavicencio	UAM-Xochimilco Mexico	Mexico	dvillavic@correo.xoc.uam.mx
Najib	Hatimi	Académie Hassan II des sciences	Morocco	najib.hatimi@gmail.com
Hicham	Boutracheh	IMIST	Morocco	boutracheh@imist.ma
Mohamed	Essadaoui	IMIST – Director	Morocco	essadaoui@imist.ma
Zayer	El Majid	MENESFCRS	Morocco	z.elmajid@enssup.gov.ma
Abdelouahid	Ezzarfi	MENESFCRS	Morocco	a.ezzarfi@yahoo.fr
Rafael	Rodriguez	CSIC MIRA Coordinator	Spain	raro@orgc.csic.es
Isabel	Gómez	IDECYT - CCHS - CSIC	Spain	isabel.gomez@cchs.csic.es
Hatem	Mhenni	CEFI-ESSEC de Tunis	Tunisia	hatem_mhenni@yahoo.fr
Bülent	Karasözen	METU–Ankara	Turkey	bulent@metu.edu.tr
Rémi	Barré	CNAM – Paris	France	remi.barre@cnam.fr
Marianne	Noel	IFRIS	France	noel@ifris.org
Antoine	Schoen	IFRIS	France	a.schoen@esiee.fr
Rigas	Arvanitis	IRD – Bondy	France	rigas@option-service.fr
Judith	Cahen	IRD – Bondy	France	jcahen2003@yahoo.fr
Pascal	Renaud	IRD – Bondy	France	pascal.renaud@ird.fr
Dominique	Cavet	IRD – Bondy	France	dominique.cavet@ird.fr
Jacques	Gaillard	IRD – Bondy	France	jacques.gaillard211@orange.fr
Pier Luigi	Rossi	IRD – Bondy	France	rossi@bondy.ird.fr
Sandrine	Vallat	IRD – Bondy	France	vallat@bondy.ird.fr
Roland	Waast	IRD – Bondy	France	waast@bondy.ird.fr
Philippe	Hamelin	IRD – Bondy – CORUS Coordinator	France	philippe.hamelin@ird.fr
Georges	de Noni	IRD – Bondy – Director of Bondy Centre	France	Georges.Denoni@ird.fr
Patrice	Cayré	IRD – Bruxelles	France	Patrice.Cayre@ird.fr
Sébastien	Hubert	IRD Bondy AIRES Sud	France	Sebastien.hubert@ird.fr
Fatima	Ouali	MAEE-Paris	France	Fatima.OUALI@diplomatie.gouv.fr
Jean-Luc	Clément	MESR – Paris	France	jean-luc.clement@education.gouv.fr
Patrick	Séchet	OST + IRD	France	patrick.sechet@laposte.net
Philippe	Larrue	Technopolis-Paris	France	philippe.larrue@technopolis-group.com
Kadijatou	Marou Sama	Univ. Nanterre, doctorante	France	maroukadibo@yahoo.fr

SUMMARY OF WORKSHOP PROGRAMME

Monday 16th March 2009

Bienvenue aux participants / Welcome + breakfast
<i>Opening words</i> by Georges de Noni , director of IRD France-Nord research centre
<i>Introduction to the workshop: the role of indicators in MIRA project</i> Rigas Arvanitis (IRD) and Rafael Rodriguez (CSIC, MIRA coordinator)
<i>Some words</i> by Philippe Froissard Chief of section, INCO, European Commission
<u>Indicators of cooperation and policy-making</u>
<i>Indicators of research and innovation: a venture for IFRIS</i> , Marianne Noel , Deputy director IFRIS
<i>The strategic use of indicators: recent developments in defining positioning indicators</i> , Rémi Barré , CNAM, France
<i>The research-innovation nexus: innovation indicators in the Mediterranean</i> , Hatem M'henni , ESSEC, Tunisia
<i>Discussion</i>
<i>Science and technology indicators in Turkey</i> , Bülent Karasözen Middle East Technical University (METU), Ankara, Turkey
<i>The use of indicators in research policy : the case of Mexico</i> , Daniel Villavicencio , UAM, Mexico
<i>Method for the follow-up of bilateral cooperation between Latin America and Europe used in EULARINET</i> , Patrick Séchet , France
<i>Needs for the follow-up of the EU-Africa cooperation</i> Patrice Cayré , IRD Brussels
<i>Discussion</i>
LUNCH
<u>The Observatories in MIRA project</u>
<i>Setting-up a science and technology observatory in Lebanon</i> , Mouin Hamzé, Rula Atweh & Hassan Charif (CNRS), Lebanon
<i>Bibliometric unit and science indicators in Morocco</i> , Mohammed Essadaoui & Hicham Boutracheh (IMIST) – Was not presented
<i>The indicators unit of the Ministry of research in Morocco</i> , Abdelaouad Ezzarfi , MENESFCR, Morocco

Monday 16th March 2009 - suite

<u>Bibliometric sources and indicators</u>
<i>Indicators of scientific cooperation between Europe and Latin-America, Isabel Gómez, IDECYT, Spain</i>
<i>Monitoring the production of a research institute with strong collaborative linkages : the case of IRD, Dominique Cavet, France</i>
Designing a scoreboard of production at the level of disciplines: the micro-bibliometric experience in ESTIME and beyond, Pier Luigi Rossi and Roland Waast , IRD (MIRA team), France

Tuesday 11th March 2009

Presentation of the list of indicators for the MIRA project by Rigas Arvanitis and Hatem M'henni <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Contributions by participants . Examples of follow-up, etc.- Discussions on this list.
<u>Assessment of the impact of cooperation programmes</u>
Design of bibliometric indicators at the national level for international cooperation, Patrick Séchet , OST , France.
Evaluating the results of French cooperation programmes devoted to development: Philippe Hamelin , CORUS Coordinator
The case of the IFS impact assessment framework – and evaluation of research cooperations. Jacques Gaillard
A methodology for the assessment of impact and networking, Philippe Larrue , Technopolis Group, Paris
Towards a general framework for assessing the impact of cooperation programmes. Tasks for WP2 in MIRA - R. Arvanitis , WP2 - MIRA
General Discussion on the framework. Wrap-up of the Workshop
LUNCH

